

Legislative Assembly Province of Alberta

No. 39

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Wednesday, May 10, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, presented a petition from 679 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, presented a petition from 566 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, presented a petition from 856 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill requiring a minimum of two people on shifts from dark to daylight.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 766 Albertans in support of the five basic principles upon which medicare was built.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 647 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care be stopped, and that existing for-profit operations be banned.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 58 Athabasca residents requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 319 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, presented a petition from 45 Albertans requesting the addition of newer and more effective medications and therapies to the Alberta drug list.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 8 Calgary residents requesting that the Government use its legislative powers to help resolve the labour dispute at the Calgary Herald.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 603 Albertans requesting that public health care be protected, supported and enhanced, and that for-profit, private hospitals be banned from receiving public dollars.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 20 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care. On request by Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned, petition the Assembly to urge the Government to use its legislative powers to help resolve the labour dispute at the Calgary Herald.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government to protect, support, and enhance public health care in Alberta and to ban for-profit, private hospitals from receiving public dollars.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned, call upon the Legislative Assembly of Alberta to urge the Government:

- to immediately disallow any further development of the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country, including those proposals currently under consideration;
- 2. to maintain Kananaskis Country in a natural state that provides high quality wildlife habitat and nature-based recreational activities;
- 3. to create a wildland provincial park which protects the whole of the undeveloped parts of the Kananaskis and Spray Valleys.

On request by Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Langevin, Hon. Member for Lac La Biche-St. Paul, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to reinstate the front licence plate on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier:

Letter dated May 10, 2000, from John B. Zaozirny, Q.C., former Minister of Energy, to the Editor, Edmonton Journal, expressing support for Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 894/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, pursuant to the Optometry Profession Act, Ch. O-10, sec. 6(4):

Alberta College of Optometrists, Annual Report 1999

Sessional Paper 895/2000

Executive summary dated November 12, 1998, entitled "Quality Care Committee Presentation-Pilot Study: Evaluation of Contracted Surgical Services"

Sessional Paper 896/2000

Hon. Mr. Dunford, Minister of Human Resources and Employment:

Letter dated April 6, 2000, from Brigham Y. Card, Lethbridge, to Hon. Mr. Dunford, Minister of Human Resources and Employment, with associated attachments, offering comments and information regarding the opposition the Government is facing regarding the passage of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 897/2000

Mrs. Gordon, Hon. Member for Lacombe-Stettler:

Edmonton Community Lottery Board, Annual Report 1999

Sessional Paper 898/2000

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Web page and executive summary from www.garydickson.ab.ca showing results of a constituency opinion poll summary from May 1-9, 2000, regarding Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 899/2000

Web page and executive summary from www.garydickson.ab.ca showing results of a constituency opinion poll summary from April 1-28, 2000, regarding Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 900/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Petition signed by 677 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped

Sessional Paper 901/2000

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Petition from 7 third-year nursing students, University of Calgary, supporting the withdrawal of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 902/2000

Petition signed by 159 members of the Federal Superannuates National Association requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped

Sessional Paper 903/2000

Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East:

146 letters from Red Deer residents to taxpayer representatives expressing concern regarding the Government's proposal to allow private, for-profit hospitals in Alberta

Sessional Paper 904/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Petition signed by 22 Edmonton residents requesting the withdrawal of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 905/2000

FOIP (Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy) request for access to information from Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, for the number of communications received by the Premier's Office regarding support for and against Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 906/2000

Results from a survey of Edmonton-Meadowlark constituents issued May 3, 2000, regarding private for-profit hospitals and the health care system

Sessional Paper 907/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

Letter dated May 8, 2000, from Cecile L. Hansen, Edmonton, to Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, expressing opposition to the proposal to allow Regional Health Authorities to enter into contractual arrangements with private for-profit hospitals

Sessional Paper 908/2000

Letter dated May 9, 2000, from Mary-Ellen Robinson, Edmonton, to Members of the Legislative Assembly, urging Members to vote against Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, with attached Edmonton Journal article dated May 7, 2000, entitled "U.S. doctor wails over managed care" written by Ann Landers

Sessional Paper 909/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter dated March 6, 2000, from Harold and Cheri Gerbrandt, Medicine Hat, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and stating that if Bill 11 passes they will not support the Premier in the next election

Sessional Paper 910/2000

Letter dated April 15, 2000, from Richard H. Beech, Sherwood Park, to Hon. Ms Evans, Minister of Children's Services, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 911/2000

Letter dated March 8, 2000, from Shirley Thomas, Red Deer, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, requesting information and data, as previously requested from Mr. Doerksen, Hon. Member for Red Deer-South, regarding the rationale for introducing Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 912/2000

Petition signed by 235 Sisters of Assumption requesting that the Legislative Assembly reject any change in the health services legislation to use private for-profit organizations to deliver health care services currently provided by the public health care system

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods:

Petition signed by 30 Albertans expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and private for-profit hospitals

Sessional Paper 914/2000

Petition signed by 37 Albertans requesting the withdrawal of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 915/2000

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

Petition signed by 565 Albertans requesting the withdrawal of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 916/2000

Western Catholic Reporter (WCR) article, dated May 8, 2000, entitled "Scrap Bill 11, says CWL (Catholic Women's League)"

Sessional Paper 917/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

35 letters dated February 8, 2000, from Canmore, Kananaskis, and Banff residents, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Corporation development of the Spray Lakes area of Kananaskis Country, and requesting that the area be designated as a wildland provincial park

Sessional Paper 918/2000

47 letters dated February 22, 2000, from Albertans and residents of numerous other provinces to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Corporation development of the Spray Lakes area of Kananaskis Country, and requesting that the area be designated as a wildland provincial park

Sessional Paper 919/2000

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder:

150 letters from Red Deer residents, unaddressed, expressing opposition to the plans for privatization of health care and for-profit hospitals in Alberta

Sessional Paper 920/2000

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning:

Petition signed by 83 Fort McLeod residents expressing support for public health care and opposition to special private clinics and special health care services

Sessional Paper 921/2000

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood:

Letter dated May 2, 2000, from Corinne Dacyshyn, Committee Clerk, Legislative Assembly, to Members of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts, regarding the cancellation of the Public Accounts Committee meeting on May 3, 2000

Sessional Paper 922/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Letter dated February 8, 2000, from Hon. Roy Romanow, Premier of Saskatchewan, to Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, indicating that a major portion of the upcoming Premiers' conference will be focussed on health funding, in response to Mr. MacDonald's previous letter urging that the shortage of health professionals be discussed at the Premiers' conference

Sessional Paper 923/2000

Speaker's Statement

Honourable Members, before commencing Orders of the Day, the Chair would like to draw your attention to the item "Motions Other than Government Motions" found at page 6 of today's Order Paper.

Members will note that under that item, Motion 511, sponsored by the Member for Calgary-West, has been amended as is allowed under Standing Order 39.1. The Chair would like to note that the Honourable Member served notice well in advance of the 4 sitting day period stipulated in that Standing Order, however due to some internal miscommunication not the fault of the Member, this notice did not appear on the Order Paper until today.

While the notice falls slightly short of the 4-day notice by several hours, the Chair would ask for the indulgence of all the Members regarding this oversight.

Recognitions

Mrs. Forsyth, Hon. Member for Calgary-Fish Creek: Calgary Outriders Soccer Club, who will be participating in the Gothia Cup in Sweden and the Dana Cup in Denmark this summer

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning: 8 recipients of the Edmonton Downtown Business Association awards on May 5, 2000

Ms Fritz, Hon. Member for Calgary-Cross: Nightingale Nights Celebration on May 12, 2000, recognizing the 180th birthday of Florence Nightingale, and 5 dinners to raise funds for nursing education to be held in Lethbridge, Calgary, Red Deer, Edmonton, and Grande Prairie, and hosted by the Alberta Registered Nurses Educational Trust

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark: International Chronic Fatigue Syndrome Day, May 12, 2000

Mr. Cao, Hon. Member for Calgary-Fort: Steven Kong, Cassie Wang, Naloo Davoody, and Susan Duwon, recipients of the Young Immigrants of Distinction Awards, recently given out by the Calgary Immigrant Aid Society

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona: Norma Zopf, honoured at the United Way Labour Appreciation Night, May 6, 2000, for being a dedicated mother, community activist, and for volunteering throughout her life

Mr. Stevens, Hon. Member for Calgary-Glenmore: Grand opening of the 1885 Calgary Town Hall at the Heritage Park Historical Village, Calgary, on May 9, 2000

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Written Questions

The following Written Questions were ordered to stand:

WQ21, WQ22, WQ23, WQ24, WQ25.

Motions for Returns

The following Motion for Return was accepted:

MR48. Moved by Mr. Dickson on behalf of Mr. White:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing: A copy of the minutes of each meeting of the Forest Protection Advisory Committee held in the calendar years 1998 and 1999.

The following Motions for Returns were rejected:

MR33. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing: Copies of documents prepared for Alberta Treasury by Government departments between November 1, 1998 and April 3, 2000, evaluating the cost of service and revenues associated with user fees, licenses, premiums, and charges levied by Government departments.

MR34. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing: Copies of base case forecast tables and change in marginal tax rates by income class of taxpayers prepared by, or for, Alberta Treasury for the period January 1, 1999 to April 3, 2000, associated with the implementation of the Government's 11% single rate tax plan.

MR35. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing: Copies of all documents estimating the revenue impact and economic offset prepared by, or for, Alberta Treasury for the period June 1, 1999 to April 3, 2000, associated with the implementation of the Government's 11% single rate tax plan.

MR40. Moved by Mrs. Sloan on behalf of Ms Blakeman:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing: Copies of the Maintenance Enforcement Program (MEP) Business Process Improvement Strategy on systems and procedures that are in place to protect and update investments in technology.

MR44. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing: Copies of budget and financial reports for the period January 1, 1999 to April 5, 2000, as required pursuant to Articles 9.7.1, 9.8.1, and 9.8.2 of the July 12, 1996 agreement between the Government of Alberta, the Alberta Special Waste Management Corporation, Bovar Technology Ltd. Bovar Inc., Bovar (Swan Hills) Limited Partnership, 542936 Alberta Ltd., and Chem-Security (Alberta) Ltd.

MR45. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing: Copies of studies, reports, memoranda, correspondence and background documents prepared by, or for, the Department of Environment or sent to the Department of Environment, for the period January 1, 1999 to April 5, 2000, relating to a change in ownership of the Alberta Special Waste Management Treatment Centre (Swan Hills) and the importation of hazardous waste from outside of Canada.

MR49. Moved by Mr. Dickson on behalf of Mr. White:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing: A copy of the meeting summaries and council reports of all the meetings of the Alberta Forest Management Science Council held from January 23, 1998 to April 13, 2000.

Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment, tabled the following:

Report dated June 1999, entitled "Statement of Account to the Minister of Environment, the Honourable Gary Mar" prepared by the Alberta Forest Management Science Council

Sessional Paper 924/2000

The following Motions for Returns were ordered to stand:

MR39, MR47, MR50.

Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders

Third Reading

The following Bill was read a Third time and passed:

Bill 206 School (Students' Code of Conduct) Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Coutts

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bills be now read a Second time:

Bill 208 Gaming and Liquor Amendment Act, 2000 — Mrs. MacBeth

A debate followed.

The question being put, with Hon. Mr. Kowalski in the Chair, the motion was defeated. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 7

Dickson MacDonald Sapers Leibovici Nicol Sloan

MacBeth

Against the motion: 43

Amery Hancock O'Neill Broda Havelock Paszkowski Calahasen Hlady Pham Cao Jacques Renner Cardinal Johnson Severtson Shariff Coutts Klapstein Doerksen Kryczka Stelmach Ducharme Langevin Stevens Dunford Lougheed Strang Evans Lund Tannas Fischer Mar Tarchuk Forsyth Marz **Taylor** Friedel McFarland Woloshyn Fritz Nelson Zwozdesky

Haley

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at $5:16\ p.m.$ until $8:00\ p.m.$

WEDNESDAY, MAY 10, 2000— 8:00 P.M.

Government Bills and Orders

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Third time:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Jonson

Debate continued on the motion for the previous question.

The question being put, with Hon. Mr. Kowalski in the Chair, that the question be now put, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 52

Havelock O'Neill Amery **Boutilier** Herard Oberg Paszkowski Broda Hlady Calahasen Jacques Pham Cao Johnson Renner Cardinal Jonson Severtson Clegg Klapstein Shariff Coutts Klein Stelmach Doerksen Kryczka Stevens Ducharme Langevin Strang Dunford Lougheed Tannas Lund Tarchuk **Evans** Fischer Mar **Taylor** Thurber Forsyth Marz Friedel McClellan West Fritz McFarland Woloshyn Haley Nelson Zwozdesky Hancock

Against the motion: 18

Blakeman MacBeth Paul Bonner MacDonald Sapers Carlson Massey Sloan Dickson Nicol Soetaert White Gibbons Olsen Leibovici Pannu Wickman Pursuant to Standing Order 47(2), the question being put, with Hon. Mr. Kowalski in the Chair, on the motion for Third Reading of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 52

Amery Havelock O'Neill **Boutilier** Herard Oberg Broda Hlady Paszkowski Calahasen Jacques Pham Cao Johnson Renner Cardinal Jonson Severtson Klapstein Shariff Clegg Coutts Klein Stelmach Doerksen Kryczka Stevens Ducharme Langevin Strang Dunford Lougheed **Tannas** Lund Tarchuk **Evans** Fischer Mar **Taylor** Thurber Forsyth Marz Friedel West McClellan Fritz McFarland Woloshyn Haley Nelson Zwozdesky

Hancock

Against the motion: 18

Blakeman MacBeth Paul Bonner MacDonald Sapers Carlson Massey Sloan Dickson Nicol Soetaert White Gibbons Olsen Leibovici Pannu Wickman

The following Bill was read a Third time and passed:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Jonson

Second Reading

The following Bill was read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 16 Condominium Property Amendment Act, 2000 — Mrs. Laing

Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole, and the Deputy Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker resumed the Chair.

The following Bill was reported with some amendments:

Bill 15 Business Corporations Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Melchin

The following Bill was reported:

Bill 17 Fair Trading Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Ducharme

Mrs. O'Neill, Acting Chairman of Committees, tabled copies of all amendments considered by the Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Amendment to Bill 15 (Hon. Minister of Government Services) — Agreed to

Sessional Paper 925/2000

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 18 Alberta Personal Income Tax Act (\$) — Hon. Mr. Day

Debate continued on the amendment introduced by Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie on May 2, 2000, that the motion be amended by striking out all of the words after "that" and substituting the following:

Bill 18, Alberta Personal Income Tax Act, be not now read a Second time because the Assembly believes that as a result of the tax reduction measures announced in the 2000 Federal budget the Bill would not ensure that all Alberta taxpayers receive a fair tax reduction.

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, moved adjournment of debate on the reasoned amendment, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 11:52 p.m. until Thursday, May 11, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski, Speaker

Title: Wednesday, May 10, 2000